

History, Development, and Current Challenges of Medical Humanities

Anne Hudson Jones, Ph.D.

**Harris L. Kempner Chair in the Humanities in Medicine
Professor, Institute for the Medical Humanities
The University of Texas Medical Branch @ Galveston
Swiss Academies of Arts and Sciences,
Berne, Switzerland, March 16, 2012**

History of Medical Humanities (USA)

Two earliest medical humanities programs

- Department of Humanities at Pennsylvania State University's (Penn State) College of Medicine, Hershey—established 1967
- Institute for the Medical Humanities (IMH), The University of Texas Medical Branch (UTMB) at Galveston—established 1973

History of Medical Humanities (USA)

Department of Humanities, Penn State College of Medicine, Hershey

- New medical school, opened in 1967
- Free-standing medical school in Hershey; Penn State's main campus 90 miles away
- Inclusion of humanities part of the vision of the founding dean, George T. Harrell, MD
- Department of Humanities planned to be “on the ground floor”—literally
- Requirement for students to take 2 humanities seminars of their choice

History of Medical Humanities (USA)

Department of Humanities, Penn State College of Medicine, Hershey

- First 3 humanities faculty members were in religion, history, and philosophy of science
- Faculty member in literature (Joanne Trautmann) added in 1972
- By 1988, 2 additional humanities faculty
- By 1992, 6 humanities faculty were in religion, history, philosophy of science, literature, anthropology, and philosophy and ethics

History of Medical Humanities (USA)

Department of Humanities, Penn State College of Medicine, Hershey

- By 1995, major curriculum change after implementation of problem-based learning (PBL)
- Added required core course for 1st-year students
- Few years later, added required core course in ethics and professionalism for 2nd-year students
- Elective seminars moved to 4th year

History of Medical Humanities (USA)

Department of Humanities, Penn State College of Medicine, Hershey

- By 2003, 6 faculty positions include
- 3 PhDs in humanities disciplines of history, literature, anthropology
- 2 MD/ethicists with clinical responsibilities in internal medicine and pediatrics
- 1 RN with PhD in health education
- In addition, 4 clinicians recognized as “joint appointments” as reward for their help in teaching increasing numbers of students

History of Medical Humanities (USA)

Department of Humanities, Penn State College of Medicine, Hershey

- By 2003, mission statement:
- “To engender a critical awareness of the values, presuppositions, and methods that undergird medical education and practice;
- An appreciation for ethical issues in medicine;
- Empathy for the patient’s experience of illness;

History of Medical Humanities (USA)

Department of Humanities, Penn State College of Medicine, Hershey

- By 2003, mission statement (continued):
- Awareness of social values and beliefs that shape the behaviors and expectations of patients, physicians, and research;
- A critical understanding of one's own capabilities and limitations; and
- A self-perpetuating intellectual curiosity.”

History of Medical Humanities (USA)

Institute for the Medical Humanities, Univ. of Texas Medical Branch, Galveston

- Original medical school of University of Texas, opened in 1891
- Free-standing medical branch in Galveston; Univ. of Texas' s main campus 220 miles away
- Initiative began with hiring in 1969 of Chester R. Burns, MD, PhD, as Director of new History of Medicine Division
- H. Tristram Engelhardt Jr, MD, PhD (philosophy of medicine) joined faculty in 1972

History of Medical Humanities (USA)

Institute for the Medical Humanities, Univ. of Texas Medical Branch, Galveston

- Institute for the Medical Humanities established in 1973
- Had to accommodate teaching to available spaces in SOM, SON, SAHS, GSBS curricula
- By 1974, Burns and Engelhardt were teaching in all 4 Schools of the Medical Branch: Medicine (SOM); Nursing (SON); Allied Health Sciences (SAHS); and Graduate School of Biomedical Sciences (GSBS)

History of Medical Humanities (USA)

Institute for the Medical Humanities, Univ. of Texas Medical Branch, Galveston

- Received National Endowment for the Humanities (NEH) grant for \$500,000 in 1974
- With NEH funding, added new faculty in history and philosophy as well as faculty in law, literature, and religious studies
- By 1992, 8 full-time humanities faculty in history (4), law, literature, philosophy, and religious studies
- By 1992, 2 MD associate faculty--an internist/clinical ethicist and a psychiatrist/artist

History of Medical Humanities (USA)

Institute for the Medical Humanities, Univ. of Texas Medical Branch, Galveston

- Established interdisciplinary Medical Humanities Graduate Program in 1988
- Confer MA and PhD degrees
- Coordinate dual-degree tracks for MD/MA, MD/PhD, JD/MA, and JD/PhD degrees
- Major SOM curriculum change with move to problem-based learning (PBL) in 1998
- Marginalized humanities teaching in SOM

History of Medical Humanities (USA)

Institute for the Medical Humanities, Univ. of Texas Medical Branch, Galveston

- By 2003, mission statement:
- “The Institute is committed to moral inquiry, research, teaching, and professional service in medicine and health care;
- Members of the Institute engage in research on ethical and legal problems in clinical practice and biomedical research; and on philosophical, historical, visual, literary, and religious dimensions of medicine and health care.

History of Medical Humanities (USA)

Institute for the Medical Humanities, Univ. of Texas Medical Branch, Galveston

- By 2003, mission statement (continued):
- This broad-gauged inquiry provides the foundation for the activities of the Institute faculty in medical and graduate teaching, clinical ethics consultation, and health policy analysis locally and in state, national, and international academic and public forums.”

History of Medical Humanities (USA)

Institute for the Medical Humanities, Univ. of Texas Medical Branch, Galveston

Major changes in past 7 years

- New director
- Loss of 5 key humanities faculty in moves to start other programs (2) & retirements (3)
- Devastation by Hurricane Ike in 2008
- New faculty in social sciences with focus on race, health inequalities, justice, & social medicine
- New emphasis on translational research
- New research ethics consultation service

Development of Medical Humanities

Special Theme Issue on Medical Humanities of *Academic Medicine* (official journal of the American Association of Medical Colleges)—2003

- Medical Humanities Programs Featured:
- American $13 + 13 = 26$
- Canadian $2 + 1 = 3$
- International $7 + 6 = 13$

Development of Medical Humanities

Medical Humanities Programs in the USA

- **Special Theme Articles**

- University of California, Irvine, College of Medicine, Irvine, **California** (1998)
- Northwestern University's Feinberg School of Medicine, Chicago, **Illinois** (1978)
- Maine Humanities Council, Hospital-Based Literature and Medicine, Portland, **Maine** (25 hospitals) (1997)
- Michigan State University College of Medicine, East Lansing, **Michigan** (1977)
- University of Missouri-Kansas City School of Medicine, **Missouri** (1992)
- New York University School of Medicine, New York City, **New York** (1978)

Development of Medical Humanities

Medical Humanities Programs in the USA

- **Special Theme Articles**

- Stony Brook University School of Medicine, Stony Brook, **New York** (1990)
- University of Rochester School of Medicine and Dentistry, Rochester, **New York** (1987)
- Hiram College, Hiram, **Ohio** (1999)
- Northeastern Ohio Universities College of Medicine, Rootstown, **Ohio** (ca. 1974)
- Pennsylvania State University College of Medicine, Hershey, **Pennsylvania** (1967)
- University of Texas Health Science Center at San Antonio, **Texas** (2002)
- University of Texas Medical Branch at Galveston, **Texas** (1973)

Development of Medical Humanities

Medical Humanities Programs in the USA

- **Special Theme Brief Articles**
- University of Arkansas College of Medicine, Little Rock, **Arkansas** (1982)
- Stanford University School of Medicine, Palo Alto, **California** (2000)
- University of California, San Francisco, School of Medicine, San Francisco, **California** (1999)
- University of South Florida, Tampa, **Florida** (mid-1980s)
- Southern Illinois University School of Medicine, Springfield, **Illinois** (1976)

Development of Medical Humanities

Medical Humanities Programs in the USA

- **Special Theme Brief Articles**
- University of Illinois at Chicago, **Illinois** (1978)
- University of Michigan Medical School, Ann Arbor, **Michigan** (1991)
- Saint Patrick Hospital and Health Sciences Center and the University of Montana, Missoula, **Montana** (1987)
- University of Nebraska College of Medicine, Omaha, **Nebraska** (1980)
- Davidson College, Davidson, **North Carolina** (mid-1980s)

Development of Medical Humanities

Medical Humanities Programs in the USA

- **Special Theme Brief Articles**
- Brody School of Medicine at East Carolina University, Greenville, **North Carolina** (1978)
- Drexel University College of Medicine, Philadelphia, **Pennsylvania** (1987)
- University of Virginia School of Medicine, Charlottesville, **Virginia** (1991)

Development of Medical Humanities

Medical Humanities Program in Canada

- **Special Theme Articles**

- University of Manitoba, Winnipeg, **Manitoba** (1988)
- Dalhousie University Faculty of Medicine, **Nova Scotia** (1992)

- **Special Theme Brief Article**

- Memorial University of Newfoundland Faculty of Medicine, **Newfoundland** (1996)

Development of Medical Humanities

International Medical Humanities Programs

- **Special Theme Articles**

- National University of La Plata, **Argentina** (1976)
- Institute for the History and Philosophy of Sciences, Zagreb University, Zagreb, **Croatia** (1999)
- Charité, Humboldt University, Berlin, **Germany** (1999)
- University of Oslo Faculty of Medicine, Oslo, **Norway** (1996)
- Karolinska Institute, Stockholm, **Sweden** (1998)
- University of Geneva School of Medicine, **Switzerland** (2001)
- Royal Free and University College Medical School, London, **United Kingdom** (1998)

Development of Medical Humanities

International Medical Humanities Programs

- **Special Theme Brief Articles**
- University of Sydney, Faculty of Medicine, Sydney, **Australia** (nd)
- University Hospital Hamburg-Eppendorf, University of Hamburg, Institute for the History and Ethics of Medicine, Hamburg, **Germany** (2003)
- Faculty of Medicine of the Technion-Israel Institute of Technology, Haifa, **Israel** (1997)
- University of Auckland, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, Auckland, **New Zealand** (1996)

Development of Medical Humanities

International Medical Humanities Programs

- **Special Theme Brief Articles**
- National Taiwan University College of Medicine, Taipei, **Taiwan** (1997)
- University of Durham and University of Newcastle (joint program), Durham and Newcastle-upon-Tyne, **United Kingdom** (2000)

Current Challenges of Medical Humanities (USA)

- Tensions between bioethics and medical humanities
- Increasing focus on professionalism in medical education and practice
- Global economic collapse and widespread budget cuts in medicine, health care, and education
- Demand for evaluation and assessment as part of increased accountability
- PRIME (Project to Rebalance and Integrate Medical Education) initiative

Current Challenges of Medical Humanities (USA)

Tensions between bioethics and medical humanities

- Medical humanities programs usually include bioethics
- Bioethics programs do not necessarily include medical humanities
- Tensions exacerbated by merger of Society for Health and Human Values (SHHV), American Association for Bioethics (AAB), and Society for Bioethics Consultation (SBC) into American Society for Bioethics and Humanities (ASBH or ASBh) in 1995

Current Challenges of Medical Humanities (USA)

Tensions between bioethics and medical humanities

- SHHV—the medical humanities group—brought most financial resources to the ASBH
- But AAB and SBC brought most members to ASBH, which is dominated by bioethicists
- Most historians dropped out of ASBH
- Literature, arts, and visual studies members talk openly about forming a new organization for medical humanities
- Theme of 2012 ASBH meeting is “Representing Bioethics”

Current Challenges of Medical Humanities (USA)

Increasing focus on professionalism in medical education and practice

- Joint project of the American Board of Internal Medicine (ABIM) Foundation, the American College of Physicians-American Society of Internal Medicine (ACP-ASIM) Foundation, and the European Federation of Internal Medicine, 2002
- Professionalism charter initiated and written by physicians
- Professionalism includes some goals and activities of bioethics and medical humanities

Current Challenges of Medical Humanities (USA)

Increasing focus on professionalism in medical education and practice

- Some believe that professionalism is medicine's way of taking back these concerns from non-MD bioethicists and medical humanists
- Others express concerns that professionalism has been trivialized by apparent greater focus (in medical students' eyes) on etiquette rather than on more serious matters such as ethics

Current Challenges of Medical Humanities (USA)

Global economic collapse and widespread budget cuts in medicine, health care, and education

- Humanities programs have been hit hard even at well-established undergraduate public universities (e.g. SUNY-Albany)
- Medical humanities programs are also at risk
- Faculty under increasing pressures to bring in clinical or grant funding of their own
- Clinicians and social scientists have more opportunities to find funding

Current Challenges of Medical Humanities (USA)

Demand for evaluation and assessment as part of increased accountability

- Difficult to evaluate outcomes of teaching medical humanities in quantitative measures
- What cannot be evaluated by quantitative measures is often dismissed as unimportant
- Puts medical humanities at risk in medical education
- Bioethics not so vulnerable
- Are now ethics questions on the U.S. Medical Licensing Examination (USMLE)

Current Challenges of Medical Humanities (USA)

PRIME (Project to Rebalance and Integrate Medical Education) initiative

- Started in 2009 by David J. Doukas, MD (bioethicist), Laurence B. McCullough, PhD (philosopher & bioethicist), and Stephen Wear, PhD (philosopher & bioethicist)
- Used 2010 centennial of the 1910 Flexner Report (*Medical Education in the United States and Canada: A Report to the Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching*) to call for reform of medical humanities teaching in medical schools in USA

Current Challenges of Medical Humanities (USA)

PRIME initiative

- In 2010, Doukas et al. proposed 4-year standardized longitudinal curriculum for clinically relevant medical humanities, to be called the Art and Culture of Medicine (*Acad Med* 2010)
- Focus to be on “patient care and professional formation of medical students” (p 322)
- Goal is “to train medical students and residents comprehensively in humane, professional care” (p 318)

Current Challenges of Medical Humanities (USA)

PRIME initiative

- Proposed 4 components of curriculum:
 - “Argument-based reasoning in medical ethics” to “learn to assess how ethical analysis and argument . . . apply to clinical care, research, and leadership”
 - “Narrative-based reasoning in literature” to promote “introspection and empathy”
 - “Creative reasoning in the fine arts” to develop “skills of slow looking”
 - “Historical reasoning in learning from the past to uncover hidden assumptions and biases” (p 322)

Current Challenges of Medical Humanities (USA)

PRIME initiative

- At ASBH meeting in 2011, Doukas et al. held session reporting on their progress
- PRIME 1 (2010) & PRIME 2 (2011) had convened national panel of 12 experts to describe “major pedagogical goals of art, ethics, history, and literature in medical education, how these disciplines should be integrated with one another in medical education, and how they could be best integrated into undergraduate and graduate medical education” (*Acad Med* 2012, p 334)

Current Challenges of Medical Humanities (USA)

PRIME initiative

- At ASBH presentation in October 2011, Doukas et al. were strongly criticized by medical humanities scholars because no one on their expert panel had a terminal degree (PhD or MFA) in literature and narrative studies or in art and visual studies
- Protest letter was circulated and signed by medical humanities scholars in literature, narrative, art, visual studies, film, and others who thought their exclusion from the PRIME process was wrong

Current Challenges of Medical Humanities (USA)

PRIME initiative

- Tone of response letter from Doukas et al. to protest letter made things worse
- This incident has exacerbated tensions between bioethicists and medical humanities
- Stakes are high because PRIME leaders have aligned themselves with representatives from several important groups in medical education
- Efforts now underway by Doukas to try to resolve conflict by including scholars from literature and art at PRIME meeting in May 2012

In Closing

- I hope this brief history and outline of current challenges from the American experience with medical humanities will be helpful as you develop your plans for medical humanities in Switzerland
- I thank you for inviting me to participate in your meeting today
- I wish you all the best for the future of your work

References

- Dittrich, Lisa R., ed. Special Theme Issue on Medical Humanities. *Acad Med* **78**, no. 10 (October 2003): 951-1038.
- Doukas, David J., Laurence B. McCullough, and Stephen Wear. Medical Education in Medical Ethics and Humanities as the Foundation for Developing Medical Professionalism. *Acad Med* **87**, no. 3 (March 2012): 334-341.
- Doukas, David J., Laurence B. McCullough, and Stephen Wear. Reforming Medical Education in Ethics and Humanities by Finding Common Ground with Abraham Flexner. *Acad Med* **85**, no. 2 (February 2010): 318-323.

References

- Flexner, Abraham. Medical Education in the United States and Canada. A Report to the Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching. Bulletin No. 4. Boston: Updyke, 1910.
- Hawkins, Anne Hunsaker, James O. Ballard, and David J. Hufford. Humanities Education at Pennsylvania State University College of Medicine, Hershey, Pennsylvania. *Acad Med* **78**, no. 10 (October 2003): 1001-1005.
- Jones, Anne Hudson, and Ronald A. Carson. Medical Humanities at the University of Texas Medical Branch in Galveston. *Acad Med* **78**, no. 10 (October 2003): 1006-1009.

References

- Louis-Courvoisier, Micheline. Medical Humanities: A New Undergraduate Teaching Program at the University of Geneva School of Medicine, Switzerland. *Acad Med* **78**, no. 10 (October 2003): 1043-1047.
- McElhinney Thomas K., ed. *Human Values Teaching Programs for Health Professionals: Self-Descriptive Reports from Twenty-nine Schools*, 3rd ed. Philadelphia: Society for Health and Human Values, 1976
- Medical Professionalism in the New Millennium: A Physician's Charter. Project of the ABIM Foundation, the ACP-ASIM Foundation, and the European Federation of Internal Medicine. *Ann Intern Med* **136** (2002): 243-246.